



CUNY Humanities Alliance

A Bibliography of Open Pedagogy and Doctoral Education References

Compiled by Drs. Sujung Kim and Jessie Fredlund

Edited by Thayer Hastings

Executive Summary

by Christina Katopodis, PhD

This collection of resources, compiled by Drs. Sujung Kim and Jessie Fredlund in 2020-2021, surveys a wealth of references focused on open pedagogy and experiential learning in higher education, including foundational texts and an array of articles exploring implementation, as well as references related to the landscape of doctoral education issues in the humanities, such as articles that rethink doctoral education and professional development, and ones that focus on the experiences of BIPOC and first-generation doctoral students especially.

This bibliography is impressive in its magnitude and coverage, including over 150 references, and almost all accompanied by abstract summaries. The authors have chosen to include a range of genres—scholarly articles, published books, open educational resources such as blog posts, and more—that allow a reader access to various spaces of dialogue and metareflection in higher education discourse. This introduction offers a sweeping executive summary of the 64-page collection and, while much of the nuance and detail is lost in this generalizing mode, I hope it will tease the reader into exploring this treasure-trove of resources that Drs. Kim and Fredlund have compiled.

This collection, provided to the public by the [Humanities Alliance](#) at the City University of New York (CUNY), will be of interest to anyone seeking a broader understanding of shifts in teaching practices made by faculty, staff, and administrators (many of whom are collaborating with their students) who are working to establish more democratic models for higher education, and the issues many doctoral students face that have a wide-ranging impact on the shape of the professoriate.

Open Pedagogy and Experiential Learning in Higher Education

The first part of the bibliography features foundational articles on open education, examining its history and the relationship between open educational practices and issues of equity, especially equal access. Many of the articles introduce the concept of open pedagogy and explore the complementary shift in emphasis from providing open educational resources (OER) to using open educational *practices*, as well as existing tensions. The resources address transformation in learning paradigms from traditional models to more student-driven and collaborative approaches. The citations are organized into the following sections:

1. Open Pedagogy and Experiential Learning in Higher Education

2. Defining Open Pedagogy
3. Implementing Open Pedagogies: Challenges and Opportunities, Student Perceptions and Case Studies
4. Professional Development and Training in Open Pedagogies
5. Experiential Learning: Foundational Texts
6. Experiential Learning: Implementing Experiential Learning in Higher Education Pedagogy

One of the main points to take away from this body of literature is that open education promotes innovative pedagogical practices that democratize the classroom and increase students' access to higher education. Some of the key findings and themes include but are not limited to:

Open Education as a Human Right: Open education is framed as an effort to democratize education by providing access, agency, ownership, participation, and experience to people around the world.

Open Educational Resources (OER) vs. Open Educational Practices (OEP): The open education movement encompasses a wide range of complementary tools and practices as well as persistent tensions between the adoption of OER tools and resources and, in teaching practices, embracing the powerful methodology of open pedagogy, where students actively participate in the construction of knowledge(s). One adoption (of a tool or practice) does not necessarily include the other. The sources included here argue for a shift in focus from tools to practices, arguing that open access is not the final destination, however this is just one strain of the wider discourse. The authors of the included studies generally promote student-driven and independent activity through open learning cultures that encourage peer-to-peer learning.

Openness as an Ecology (In and Outside the Classroom): There are different frameworks and terminology for open education, but the overarching themes include the shift from knowledge transfer (or the "banking model" that Paulo Freire protests against in *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*) to developing competencies and skills-based learning; and the importance of informal learning opportunities in a supportive, exploratory learning environment. Faculty communities that mutually support focus on learner agency and autonomy are critical for the success of open pedagogy initiatives.

Professional Development: Open educational practices can effectively contribute to students' career readiness by enhancing students' skills and technical knowledge. In addition to the resources provided in the bibliography, see [NACE career readiness competencies](#), which closely match the skills practiced in active learning classrooms.

Student Collaboration and Change in Higher Education: OER can be significant agents of change in teaching practice and can contribute to systemic change in higher education, having demonstrated an impact on student performance.

Experiential Learning: Experiential learning provides a structured approach to learning through concrete exposure and interaction, first-hand observation, reflection, and practical application. These experiences can happen through visits to other places and through project-based learning. Overall, experiential learning contributes to students' development, competencies, career readiness, memory and retention, and are equally important to undergraduate and doctoral students. Clear requirements and expectations, adequate financial support, and increased faculty-student interactions contribute to student success in experiential learning environments.

These sources also highlight challenges, such as the need for changes in institutional policies to foster openness effectively and consistently across classrooms and disciplines.

Issues in Doctoral Education

The second part of the bibliography focuses on doctoral education. The collection focuses especially on the experiences of underrepresented doctoral students, shedding light on both the challenges and opportunities they encounter. The citations are organized into the following sections:

1. Contemporary Doctoral Education: Overview
2. Rethinking Doctoral Education
3. Pedagogy in Doctoral Education
4. Professional Development and Socialization in Doctoral Education
5. Doctoral Student Experiences: Relationships, Agency, and Well-Being
6. Underrepresented and First Generation Doctoral Students
7. Measuring Doctoral Success

These studies offer recommendations and identify challenges that can inform educational practices and policy development in higher education. The overview is helpful to a reader interested in the general shape of discourse on doctoral education from the last twenty years. For example, one study (Golde & Dore, 2001) highlights the mismatch between the purpose of doctoral education and career aspirations. In a meta-study examining 995 papers written on issues of doctoral studies from 1971 to 2012, Jones (2013) identifies six central themes in the management and training of doctoral students: teaching, doctoral program design, writing and research, employment and career, student-supervisor relationship, and the doctoral student experience.

Some common themes and insights from this large body of articles include:

- Doctoral student socialization as crucial to introducing students to the hidden curriculum, including academic norms, values, and practices that they may or may not be aware of;
- The concept of agency, or students' active participation, influence, and control over their own doctoral journeys;
- The unique challenges of underrepresented and first-generation students that require specific support mechanisms, systemic changes, and an asset-based mindset;
- The many challenges doctoral students face, including financial stress, emotional exhaustion and creative burnout, and issues related to race and ethnicity; and
- The quality of the supervisory relationship between students and their advisers, which influences students' emotional well-being and motivation to complete their studies.

Based on this body of findings, to improve the doctoral student experience and increase retention, authors of these studies recommend institutions and faculty advisors consider some of the following:

Support Student Agency: Encourage students to take an active role in shaping their doctoral journey, fostering a sense of ownership and autonomy.

Diversify Support Mechanisms: Recognize the diverse backgrounds of doctoral students and provide a range of tailored support(s) and resources to address their specific needs.

Improve Supervision and Mentorship: Invest in the quality of faculty-student relationships, focusing on open communication, emotional support, and promoting a growth mindset.

Facilitate Discussions on Race and Privilege: Encourage informed dialogues on race, ethnicity, and privilege within the academic community to foster greater awareness, promote inclusivity, and address issues that underrepresented students face.

Identify and Address Challenges: Proactively identify common challenges such as financial stress and emotional exhaustion and provide communal and institutional mechanisms to address these issues.

Foster Inclusivity and Cultural Sensitivity: Create an academic environment that values diversity and recognizes the valuable contributions of all students.

While challenges and disparities can feel insurmountable, these articles also highlight the agency and resilience of doctoral students. For more detailed recommendations, please take a moment to review the article abstracts. The collection emphasizes the experiences of BIPOC and first-generation students. Some of the common themes that emerge across studies that directly take up the challenges faced by these doctoral students:

Otherness and Identity: Many of these articles emphasize how students from underrepresented groups often feel marginalized in Predominantly White Institutions (PWIs) and a range of academic environments. This sense of otherness impacts their confidence and ease within the academy, their sense of belonging, their health and wellness, and their motivation.

Faculty Mentorship: Effective faculty mentorship is consistently highlighted as a key factor in the success and persistence of underrepresented students. Positive mentoring relationships can provide crucial support and guidance throughout doctoral education. Many articles call attention to the need for greater diversity among faculty.

Intersectionality: The intersection of multiple identities, such as being both Black and female or an international student, introduces unique and often compounded challenges. These intersections influence students' support needs, showing, again, the importance of diversifying sources of support.

Community and Peer Networks: A supportive community of peers is important for doctoral students, and especially for underrepresented students. Effective socialization can contribute to a sense of community and belonging.

Asset-Based Approaches: Some articles advocate for [asset-based approaches](#), which means recognizing difference and diversity as a *strength*. The unique perspectives that underrepresented students bring to academia are respected as positive assets.

Evolution of Doctoral Education: Doctoral education is changing, and the authors of these articles emphasize the need for inclusive practices, policies, and a recognition of the changing academic landscape to meet changing student needs and job markets.

These articles collectively underscore the significance of faculty mentorship, peer- and near-peer networks and communities, diversity, and innovative, equitable, asset-based policies and practices in cultivating an environment of belonging for underrepresented students in doctoral education. Addressing the challenges and fostering a more inclusive and equitable academic environment is essential for the success and retention of diverse groups of doctoral students, and could help to contribute to a more diverse professoriate.

In addition to the bibliography below, you can find even more resources in this Zotero group, compiled by Futures Initiative Graduate Fellow Coline Chevrin:

https://www.zotero.org/groups/4633798/humanities_alliance?token=lmf7i6qk0ticq5c81yb6ln9wgdeght4071zqy3g4

A Bibliography of Open Pedagogy and Doctoral Education References

Compiled by Drs. Sujung Kim and Jessie Fredlund
Edited by Thayer Hastings

Table of Contents

[I. Open Pedagogy and Experiential Learning in Higher Education](#)

[A. Open Pedagogy and Open Education: Early Foundations](#)

[B. Defining Open Pedagogy](#)

[C. Implementing Open Pedagogies](#)

[D. Professional Development and Training in Open Pedagogies](#)

[E. Unsorted Articles on Open Pedagogy](#)

[F. Experiential Learning: Foundational Texts](#)

[G. Implementing Experiential Learning in Higher Education Pedagogy](#)

[II. Doctoral Education Issues in the Humanities](#)

[A. Contemporary Doctoral Education: Overview](#)

[B. Rethinking Doctoral Education](#)

[C. Pedagogy in Doctoral Education](#)

[D. Professional Development and Socialization in Doctoral Education](#)

[E. Doctoral Student Experiences: Relationships, Agency, and Well-Being](#)

[F. Underrepresented and First Generation Doctoral Students](#)

[G. Measuring Doctoral Success](#)

I. Open Pedagogy and Experiential Learning in Higher Education

A. Open Pedagogy and Open Education: Early Foundations

Barth, Ronald S. "[Open education—assumptions about learning.](#)" *Educational Philosophy and Theory* 1, no. 2 (1969): 29-39.

Hyland, John T. "[Open education: a slogan examined.](#)" *Educational Studies* 5, no. 1 (1979): 35-41.

Mai, Robert P. "[Open education: From ideology to orthodoxy.](#)" *Peabody Journal of Education* 55, no. 3 (1978): 231-237.

Noddings, Nel, and D. Scott Enright. "[The promise of open education.](#)" *Theory Into Practice* 22, no. 3 (1983): 182-189.

B. Defining Open Pedagogy

Blessinger, Patrick, and T. J. Bliss. "[Introduction to open education: Towards a human rights theory.](#)" *Open education: international perspectives in high education*. Cambridge, Reino Unido, Openbook Publishers (2016): 11-30.

DeRosa, Robin, and Scott Robison. "[From OER to open pedagogy: Harnessing the power of open.](#)" *Open: The philosophy and practices that are revolutionizing education and science* (2017): 115-124.

Ehlers, Ulf-Daniel. "[Extending the territory: From open educational resources to open educational practices.](#)" *Journal of Open, Flexible, and Distance Learning* 15, no. 2 (2011): 1-10.

Ehlers, Ulf-Daniel. *Open learning cultures*. Springer-Verlag Berlin and Heidelberg GmbH & Company KG, 2013.

Hegarty, Bronwyn. "[Attributes of open pedagogy: A model for using open educational resources.](#)" *Educational technology* (2015): 3-13.

Hodgkinson-Williams, Cheryl, and Eve Gray. "[Degrees of openness: The emergence of open educational resources at the University of Cape Town.](#)" *International Journal of Education and Development Using ICT* 5, no. 5 (2009): 101-116.

Nascimbeni, Fabio, and Daniel Burgos. "[In search for the open educator: Proposal of a definition and a framework to increase openness adoption among university educators.](#)"

International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning: IRRODL 17, no. 6 (2016): 1-17.

Ossiannilsson, E. (2018). "[Ecologies of Openness: Reformations through Open Pedagogy](#)." *Asian Journal of Distance Education*, 13(2), 103-119.

Pomerantz, Jeffrey, and Robin Peek. "[Fifty shades of open](#)." *First Monday* (2016).

Wiley, David. 2013. "[What is Open Pedagogy?](#)" (blog post).

Wiley, David, and John Levi Hilton III. "[Defining OER-enabled pedagogy](#)." *International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning* 19.4 (2018).

C. Implementing Open Pedagogies

Beetham, Helen, Isobel Falconer, Lou McGill, and Allison Littlejohn. "[Open practices: Briefing paper](#)." (2012)

Conole, Gráinne. [Designing for learning in an open world](#). Vol. 4. Springer Science & Business Media, 2012.

Cronin, Catherine. "[Openness and praxis: Exploring the use of open educational practices in higher education](#)." *International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning: IRRODL* 18, no. 5 (2017): 15-34.

Glennie, Jenny, Ken Harley, Neil Butcher, and Trudi van Wyk. [Open educational resources and change in higher education: Reflections from practice](#). Commonwealth of Learning, Vancouver, 2012.

Hollich, Shanna, and Jacob Moore. "[Open Pedagogy Big and Small: Comparing Open Pedagogy Efforts in Large and Small Higher Education Settings](#)." *Open Pedagogy Approaches* (2020).

Jhangiani, Rajiv S., Rebecca Pitt, Christina Hendricks, Jessie Key, and Clint Lalonde. "[Exploring faculty use of open educational resources at British Columbia post-secondary institutions](#)." BCcampus Research Report (2016).

Jung, Eulho, Christine Bauer, and Allan Heaps. "[Strategic implementation of open educational resources in higher education institutions](#)." *Educational Technology* (2017): 78-84.

Lewis, Stephanie N., Anne M. Brown, and Amanda B. MacDonald. "[Open Pedagogical Practices to Train Undergraduates in the Research Process: A Case Study in Course Design and Co-Teaching Strategies](#)." *Open Pedagogy Approaches* (2020).

Masterman, Elizabeth. "[Bringing open educational practice to a research-intensive university: Prospects and challenges](#)." *Electronic Journal of E-Learning* 14, no. 1 (2016).

Paskevicius, Michael, and Cheryl Hodgkinson-Williams. "[Student perceptions of the creation and reuse of digital educational resources in a community development-oriented organisation](#)." *Journal of Learning for Development* 5, no. 1 (2018): 22-39.

Paskevicius, Michael, and Valerie Irvine. "[Practicalities of implementing open pedagogy in higher education](#)." *Smart Learning Environments* 6.1 (2019): 1-20

Paskevicius, Michael, and Valerie Irvine. "[Open Education and Learning Design: Open Pedagogy in Praxis](#)." *Journal of Interactive Media in Education* 2019, no. 1 (2019).

D. Professional Development and Training in Open Pedagogies

Borthwick, K., & Gallagher-Brett, A. (2014). "[‘Inspiration, ideas, encouragement’: Teacher development and improved use of technology in language teaching through open educational practice](#)." *Computer Assisted Language Learning*, 27(2), 163–183.

Kaatrakoski, Heli, Allison Littlejohn, and Nina Hood. "[Learning challenges in higher education: an analysis of contradictions within Open Educational Practice](#)." *Higher education* 74, no. 4 (2017): 599-615.

Littlejohn, Allison, and Nina Hood. "[How educators build knowledge and expand their practice: The case of open education resources](#)." *British Journal of Educational Technology* 48, no. 2 (2017): 499-510.

Sinkinson, Caroline, and Amanda McAndrew. "[Approaching open pedagogy in community and collaboration](#)." *Open Pedagogy Approaches: Faculty, Library, and Student Collaborations* (2020): 42.

E. Unsorted Articles on Open Pedagogy

Bali, Maha, Catherine Cronin, and Rajiv S. Jhangiani. "[Framing Open Educational Practices from a Social Justice Perspective](#)." *Journal of Interactive Media in Education* 2020, no. 1 (2020).

Butcher, Neil. [A basic guide to open educational resources \(OER\)](#). Commonwealth of Learning (COL), 2015.

Hoffman, Kimberly Davies, Rose-Marie Chierici, and Amanda Spence. "[‘What If We Were To Go?’: Undergraduates Simulate the Building of an NGO From Theory To Practice](#)." *Open Pedagogy Approaches* (2020).

Knox, Jeremy. "[Five critiques of the open educational resources movement.](#)" *Teaching in Higher Education* 18, no. 8 (2013): 821-832.

Lane, Andy, and Patrick McAndrew. "[Are open educational resources systematic or systemic change agents for teaching practice?](#)" *British Journal of Educational Technology* 41, no. 6 (2010): 952-962.

Mezirow, J. D. "[A Critical Theory of Adult Learning and Education.](#)" *Adult Education*, 32(1) (1981): 3-24

Visintainer, Sean, Stephanie Anckle, and Kristen Weischedel. "[Whose History?: Expanding Place-Based Initiatives Through Open Collaboration.](#)" Milne Publishing, 2020.

Weller, Martin. [The battle for open.](#) Ubiquity Press, 2014.

Weller, Martin, Bea De los Arcos, Rob Farrow, Beck Pitt, and Patrick McAndrew. "[The impact of OER on teaching and learning practice.](#)" *Open Praxis* 7, no. 4 (2015): 351-361.

Wiley, David, Ashley Webb, Sarah Weston, and DeLaina Tonks. "[A preliminary exploration of the relationships between student-created OER, sustainability, and students' success.](#)" *The International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning* 18, no. 4 (2017).

F. Experiential Learning: Foundational Texts

Chickering, Arthur W. "[Experience and Learning. An Introduction to Experiential Learning.](#)" (1977).

Dewey, J. *Experience and Education.* New York: Collier Books, 1971 [1938]

Keeton, Morris T. [Experiential Learning: Rationale, Characteristics and Assessment.](#) Jossey-Bass, 1976.

Kolb, David A. *Experiential learning: Experience as the source of learning and development.* FT press, 2014. [1984]

G. Implementing Experiential Learning in Higher Education Pedagogy

Cantor, Jeffrey A. [Experiential Learning in Higher Education: Linking Classroom and Community.](#) *ASHE-ERIC Higher Education Report No. 7.* ERIC Clearinghouse on Higher Education, Graduate School of Education and Human Development, The George

Washington University, One Dupont Circle, Suite 630, Washington, DC 10036-1183, 1995.

Chickering, A. W. and Gamson, Z. F. "[Seven Principles for Good Practice in Undergraduate Education](#)." *AAHE Bulletin*, 1987, 3-7

Healey, Mick, and Alan Jenkins. "[Kolb's experiential learning theory and its application in geography in higher education](#)." *Journal of Geography* 99.5 (2000): 185-195.

Kolb, Alice Y., and David A. Kolb. "[Learning styles and learning spaces: Enhancing experiential learning in higher education](#)." *Academy of management learning & education* 4.2 (2005): 193-212.

Kolb, Alice Y., and David A. Kolb. "[Experiential learning theory as a guide for experiential educators in higher education](#)." *Experiential Learning & Teaching in Higher Education* 1, no. 1 (2017): 7-44.

II. Doctoral Education Issues in the Humanities

A. Contemporary Doctoral Education: Overview

Altbach, Philip G. "[Doctoral education: Present realities and future trends](#)." In *International handbook of higher education*, pp. 65-81. Springer, Dordrecht, 2007.

Ehrenberg, Ronald G., Harriet Zuckerman, Jeffrey A. Groen, and Sharon M. Brucker. [Educating scholars: Doctoral education in the humanities](#). Princeton University Press, 2009.

Golde, Chris M., and Timothy M. Dore. "[At cross purposes: What the experiences of today's doctoral students reveal about doctoral education](#)." (2001)

Jones, Michael. "[Issues in Doctoral Studies-Forty Years of Journal Discussion: Where have we been and where are we going?](#)" In *Proceedings of the Informing Science and Information Technology Education Conference*, pp. 83-104. Informing Science Institute, 2013.

Kehm, Barbara M. "[Doctoral education in Europe and North America: A comparative analysis](#)." *Wenner Gren International Series* 83 (2006): 67.

B. Rethinking Doctoral Education

Boud, David, and Alison Lee, eds. [*Changing Practices of Doctoral Education*](#). Routledge, 2009.

Green, Bill. "[Challenging Perspectives, Changing Practices: Doctoral Education in Transition](#)." In *Changes Practices of Doctoral Education*, edited by David Boud and Alison Lee, 239-248. Routledge, 2009.

Heathcott, Joseph. "[Blueprints, tools, and the reality before us: Improving doctoral education in the humanities](#)." *Change: The Magazine of Higher Learning* 39, no. 5 (2007): 46-51.

McAlpine, Lynn, and Judith Norton. "[Reframing our approach to doctoral programs: An integrative framework for action and research](#)." *Higher Education Research & Development* 25, no. 1 (2006): 3-17.

McAlpine, Lynn, Anthony Pare, and Doreen Starke-Meyerring. "[Disciplinary Voices: A Shifting Landscape for English Doctoral Education in the Twenty-First Century](#)." In *Changes Practices of Doctoral Education*, edited by David Boud and Alison Lee, 42-53. Routledge, 2009.

Pearson, Margot, Terry Evans, and Peter Macauley. "The diversity and complexity of settings and arrangements forming the 'experienced environments' for doctoral candidates: Some implications for doctoral education." *Studies in Higher Education* 41, no. 12 (2016): 2110-2124.

Prøitz, Tine S., and Line Wittek. "[New directions in doctoral programmes: bridging tensions between theory and practice?](#)" *Teaching in Higher Education* (2019).

Rogers, Katina L. [*Putting the Humanities PhD to Work: Thriving in and beyond the Classroom*](#). Duke University Press, 2020.

Smith, Sidonie. [*Manifesto for the humanities: Transforming doctoral education in good enough times*](#). University of Michigan Press, 2015

Walker, George E., Chris M. Golde, Laura Jones, Andrea Conklin Bueschel, and Pat Hutchings. [*The formation of scholars: Rethinking doctoral education for the twenty-first century*](#). Vol. 11. John Wiley & Sons, 2009.

C. Pedagogy in Doctoral Education

Abiddin, Norhasni Zainal, Affero Ismail, and Azahari Ismail. "[Effective supervisory approach in enhancing postgraduate research studies](#)." *International journal of humanities and social science* 1, no. 2 (2011): 206-217.

- Brew, Angela and Tai Peseta. "[Supervision Development and Recognition in a Reflexive Space](#)." In *Changes Practices of Doctoral Education*, edited by David Boud and Alison Lee, 126-140. Routledge, 2009
- Brodin, Eva M. "[Critical and creative thinking nexus: learning experiences of doctoral students](#)." *Studies in Higher Education* 41, no. 6 (2016): 971-989.
- Brodin, Eva M. "[The stifling silence around scholarly creativity in doctoral education: Experiences of students and supervisors in four disciplines](#)." *Higher Education* 75, no. 4 (2018): 655-673.
- Carter, Susan, and Deborah Laurs, eds. [Developing generic support for doctoral students: Practice and pedagogy](#). Routledge, 2014.
- Danby, Susan, and Alison Lee. "[Researching Doctoral Pedagogy Close up: Design and Action in Two Doctoral Programmes](#)." *Australian Universities' Review* 54, no. 1 (2012): 19-28.
- Ehrenberg, Ronald G., George H. Jakubson, Jeffrey A. Groen, Eric So, and Joseph Price. "[Inside the black box of doctoral education: What program characteristics influence doctoral students' attrition and graduation probabilities?](#)" *Educational evaluation and policy analysis* 29, no. 2 (2007): 134-150.
- Gilbert, Rob. "[The Doctorate as Curriculum: a Perspective on Goals and Outcomes of Doctoral Education](#)." In *Changes Practices of Doctoral Education*, edited by David Boud and Alison Lee, 54-68. Routledge, 2009.
- Ismail, Affero, Norhasni Zainal Abiddin, and Aminuddin Hassan. "[Improving the Development of Postgraduates' Research and Supervision](#)." *International Education Studies* 4, no. 1 (2011): 78-89.
- Jones, Laura. "[Converging Paradigms for Doctoral Training in the Sciences and Humanities](#)." In *Changes Practices of Doctoral Education*, edited by David Boud and Alison Lee, 29-41. Routledge, 2009.
- Keefer, Jeffrey M. "[Experiencing doctoral liminality as a conceptual threshold and how supervisors can use it](#)." *Innovations in Education and Teaching International* 52, no. 1 (2015): 17-28.
- Leonard, Diana and Rosa Becker. "[Enhancing the Doctoral Experience at the Local Level](#)." In *Changes Practices of Doctoral Education*, edited by David Boud and Alison Lee, 71-86. Routledge, 2009.
- Olson, Kate, and Christopher M. Clark. "[A signature pedagogy in doctoral education: The leader-scholar community](#)." *Educational Researcher* 38, no. 3 (2009): 216-221.

Sinclair, Jennifer, Robyn Barnacle, and Denise Cuthbert. "[How the doctorate contributes to the formation of active researchers: What the research tells us.](#)" *Studies in Higher Education* 39, no. 10 (2014): 1972-1986.

Wisker, Gina. *The good supervisor: Supervising postgraduate and undergraduate research for doctoral theses and dissertations*. Macmillan International Higher Education, 2012.

D. Professional Development and Socialization in Doctoral Education

Gardner, Susan K., and Pilar Mendoza. On becoming a scholar: Socialization and development in doctoral education. Stylus, 2010. ([eBook](#), 2023)

Gopaul, Bryan. "[Distinction in doctoral education: Using Bourdieu's tools to assess the socialization of doctoral students.](#)" *Equity & Excellence in Education* 44, no. 1 (2011): 10-21.

Heflinger, Craig Anne, and Bernadette Doykos. "[Paving the pathway: Exploring student perceptions of professional development preparation in doctoral education.](#)" *Innovative higher education* 41, no. 4 (2016): 343-358.

Räsänen, Keijo, and Kirsi Korpiaho. "[Supporting doctoral students in their professional identity projects.](#)" *Studies in Continuing Education* 33, no. 1 (2011): 19-31.

Weidman, John C., and Elizabeth L. Stein. "[Socialization of doctoral students to academic norms.](#)" *Research in higher education* 44, no. 6 (2003): 641-656.

Weidman, John C., Darla J. Twale, and Elizabeth Leahy Stein. *Socialization of Graduate and Professional Students in Higher Education: A Perilous Passage? ASHE-ERIC Higher Education Report, Volume 28, Number 3. Jossey-Bass Higher and Adult Education Series*. Jossey-Bass, Publishers, 2001.

E. Doctoral Student Experiences: Relationships, Agency, and Well-Being

Acker, Sandra, and Eve Haque. "[The struggle to make sense of doctoral study.](#)" *Higher Education Research & Development* 34, no. 2 (2015): 229-241.

Cotterall, Sara. "[More than just a brain: Emotions and the doctoral experience.](#)" *Higher Education Research & Development* 32, no. 2 (2013): 174-187.

Dickerson, Shirley H., Valerie Tharp Byers, Rachel N. Smith, Eunjin Hwang, Kay E. Angrove, Jason I. Chandler, Kelsey M. Christian et al. "[Survival strategies: Doctoral students' perceptions of challenges and coping methods.](#)" (2014).

- Foot, Rachel, Alicia R. Crowe, Karen Andrus Tollafield, and Chad Everett Allan. "[Exploring doctoral student identity development using a self-study approach.](#)" *Teaching and Learning Inquiry* 2, no. 1 (2014): 103-118.
- Hopwood, Nick. "[A sociocultural view of doctoral students' relationships and agency.](#)" *Studies in Continuing Education* 32, no. 2 (2010): 103-117.
- Hopwood, Nick, and Julia Paulson. "[Bodies in narratives of doctoral students' learning and experience.](#)" *Studies in Higher Education* 37, no. 6 (2012): 667-681.
- Hopwood, Nick, and Kathryn Sutherland. "[Relationships and agency in doctoral and early career academic experience.](#)" In *Higher Education Research and Development Society of Australasia Annual Conference*. Higher Education Research & Development Society of Australasia, 2009.
- Hunter, Karen H., and Kay Devine. "[Doctoral students' emotional exhaustion and intentions to leave academia.](#)" *International Journal of doctoral studies* 11, no. 2 (2016): 35-61.
- Jazvac-Martek, Marian, Shuhua Chen, and Lynn McAlpine. "[Tracking the doctoral student experience over time: Cultivating agency in diverse spaces.](#)" In *Doctoral education: Research-based strategies for doctoral students, supervisors and administrators*, pp. 17-36. Springer, Dordrecht, 2011.
- John, Tomasz, and Pam Denicolo. "[Doctoral education: A review of the literature monitoring the doctoral student experience in selected OECD countries \(mainly UK\).](#)" *Springer Science Reviews* 1, no. 1-2 (2013): 41-49.
- McAlpine, Lynn, and Cheryl Amundsen. "[Identity and agency: Pleasures and collegiality among the challenges of the doctoral journey.](#)" *Studies in Continuing Education* 31, no. 2 (2009): 109-125.
- McAlpine, Lynn, Julia Paulson, Allison Gonsalves, and Marian Jazvac-Martek. "['Untold' doctoral stories: can we move beyond cultural narratives of neglect?.](#)" *Higher Education Research & Development* 31, no. 4 (2012): 511-523.
- McWilliams, Erica. "Doctoral Education in Risky Times." In *Changes Practices of Doctoral Education*, edited by David Boud and Alison Lee, 189-199. Routledge, 2009
- Portnoi, Laura M., Ana Lima A. Chlopecki, and Diliaana Peregrina-Kretz. "[Expanding the doctoral student socialization framework: The central role of student agency.](#)" *The Journal of Faculty Development* 29, no. 3 (2015): 5-16.

Posselt, Julie. "[Normalizing struggle: Dimensions of faculty support for doctoral students and implications for persistence and well-being.](#)" *The Journal of Higher Education* 89, no. 6 (2018): 988-1013.

Pyhältö, Kirsi, and Jenni Keskinen. "[Exploring the fit between doctoral students' and supervisors' perceptions of resources and challenges vis-à-vis the doctoral journey.](#)" *International Journal of doctoral studies* (2012).

Pyhältö, Kirsi, and Jenni Keskinen. "[Doctoral Students' Sense of Relational Agency in Their Scholarly Communities.](#)" *International Journal of Higher Education* 1, no. 2 (2012): 136-149.

Rigler Jr, Kenneth L., Linda K. Bowlin, Karen Sweat, Stephen Watts, and Robin Throne. "[Agency, Socialization, and Support: A Critical Review of Doctoral Student Attrition.](#)" *Online Submission* (2017).

Stubb, Jenni, Kirsi Pyhältö, and Kirsti Lonka. "[Balancing between inspiration and exhaustion: PhD students' experienced socio-psychological well-being.](#)" *Studies in Continuing Education* 33, no. 1 (2011): 33-50.

F. Underrepresented and First Generation Doctoral Students

Bancroft, Senetta. "[Capital, Kinship, & White Privilege. Social & Cultural Influences upon the Minority Doctoral Experience in the Sciences.](#)" *Multicultural Education* 20, no. 2 (2013): 10-16.

Barker, Marco J. "[Racial context, currency and connections: Black doctoral student and white advisor perspectives on cross-race advising.](#)" *Innovations in Education and Teaching International* 48, no. 4 (2011): 387-400.

Barker, Marco J. "[The doctorate in Black and White: Exploring the engagement of Black doctoral students in cross race advising relationships with White faculty.](#)" *Western Journal of Black Studies* 40, no. 2 (2016): 126-140.

Blockett, Reginald A., Pamela P. Felder, Walter Parrish III, and Joan Collier. "[Pathways to the Professoriate: Exploring Black Doctoral Student Socialization and the Pipeline to the Academic Profession.](#)" *Western Journal of Black Studies* 40, no. 2 (2016).

Brunsma, David L., David G. Embrick, and Jean H. Shin. "[Graduate students of color: Race, racism, and mentoring in the white waters of academia.](#)" *Sociology of Race and Ethnicity* 3, no. 1 (2017): 1-13.

Cheatham, Harold E., and Christine E. Phelps. "[Promoting the Development of Graduate Students of Color.](#)" *New Directions for Student Services* 72 (1995): 91-99.

- Cintrón, Rosa. "[Critical race theory as an analytical tool: African American male success in doctoral education](#)." *Journal of College Teaching & Learning (TLC)* 7, no. 10 (2010).
- Crumb, Loni, Natoya Haskins, Laura Dean, and Janeé Avent Harris. "[Illuminating social-class identity: The persistence of working-class African American women doctoral students](#)." *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education* 13, no. 3 (2020): 215.
- Culver, Jennifer. "[Pursuing the Professoriate: The Academic Career Development of Black Female Doctoral Students at Predominantly White Institutions](#)." PhD diss., University of Missouri-St. Louis, 2018.
- Davidson, Martin N., and Lynn Foster-Johnson. "[Mentoring in the preparation of graduate researchers of color](#)." *Review of Educational Research* 71, no. 4 (2001): 549-574.
- Ellis, Evelyn M. "[The impact of race and gender on graduate school socialization, satisfaction with doctoral study, and commitment to degree completion](#)." *Western Journal of Black Studies* 25, no. 1 (2001): 30.
- Espino, Michelle M. "[Exploring the role of community cultural wealth in graduate school access and persistence for Mexican American PhDs](#)." *American Journal of Education* 120, no. 4 (2014): 545-574.
- Felder, Pamela. "[On doctoral student development: Exploring faculty mentoring in the shaping of African American doctoral student success](#)." *Qualitative Report* 15, no. 2 (2010): 455-474.
- Felder, Pamela P., and Marco J. Barker. "[Extending Bell's concept of interest convergence: A framework for understanding the African American doctoral student experience](#)." *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 8, no. 1 (2013): 1-20.
- Felder, Pamela Petrease, Howard C. Stevenson, and Marybeth Gasman. "[Understanding race in doctoral student socialization](#)." *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 9, no. 19 (2014): 21-42.
- Gardner, Susan K. "[Fitting the mold of graduate school: A qualitative study of socialization in doctoral education](#)." *Innovative Higher Education* 33, no. 2 (2008): 125-138.
- Gardner, Susan K. "[The challenges of first-generation doctoral students](#)." *New Directions for Higher Education* 2013, no. 163 (2013): 43-54.
- Gardner, Susan K., and Karri A. Holley. "['Those invisible barriers are real': The progression of first-generation students through doctoral education](#)." *Equity & Excellence in Education* 44, no. 1 (2011): 77-92.

- Gildersleeve, Ryan Evely, Natasha N. Croom, and Philip L. Vasquez. "["Am I going crazy?!": A critical race analysis of doctoral education.](#)" *Equity & Excellence in Education* 44, no. 1 (2011): 93-114.
- Gonzalez, Kenneth P., Patricia Marin, Leonor Xochitl Perez, Mark A. Figueroa, Jose F. Moreno, and Christine N. Navia. "[Understanding the nature and context of Latina/o doctoral student experiences.](#)" *Journal of College Student Development* 42, no. 6 (2001): 563-80.
- Hall, Leigh, and Leslie Burns. "[Identity development and mentoring in doctoral education.](#)" *Harvard Educational Review* 79, no. 1 (2009): 49-70.
- Johnson-Bailey, Juanita, Thomas Valentine, Ronald M. Cervero, and Tuere A. Bowles. "[Rooted in the soil: The social experiences of Black graduate students at a southern research university.](#)" *The Journal of Higher Education* 80, no. 2 (2009): 178-203.
- Jones, Tamara Bertrand, JeffriAnne Wilder, and La'Tara Osborne-Lampkin. "[Employing a Black feminist approach to doctoral advising: Preparing Black women for the professoriate.](#)" *The Journal of Negro Education* 82, no. 3 (2013): 326-338.
- Kamimura-Jimenez, Mark, and John Gonzalez. "[Understanding PhD Latinx career outcomes: A case study.](#)" *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education* 17, no. 2 (2018): 148-168.
- McGaskey, Ferlin G. "[Facilitating the creation of knowledge: An investigation of the factors that influence the research productivity of black doctoral students at predominantly white institutions.](#)" *The Journal of Negro Education* 84, no. 2 (2015): 187-201.
- Means, Darris R., Cameron C. Beatty, Reginald A. Blockett, Michael Bumbry, Robert L. Canida, and Tony W. Cawthon. "[Resilient scholars: Reflections from Black gay men on the doctoral journey.](#)" *Journal of Student Affairs Research and Practice* 54, no. 1 (2017): 109-120.
- Nettles, Michael T. "[Success in doctoral programs: Experiences of minority and white students.](#)" *American Journal of Education* 98, no. 4 (1990): 494-522.
- Onwuegbuzie, Anthony J., Roslinda Rosli, Jacqueline M. Ingram, and Rebecca K. Frels. "[A critical dialectical pluralistic examination of the lived experience of select women doctoral students.](#)" *Qualitative Report* 19 (2014): 5.
- Patterson-Stewart, Karen E., Martin H. Ritchie, and Eugene TW Sanders. "[Interpersonal Dynamics of African American Persistence in Doctoral Programs at Predominantly White Universities.](#)" *Journal of College Student Development* 38, no. 5 (1997): 489-98.

- Patterson-Stephens, Shawna M., and Louise Michelle Vital. "[Black doctoral women: Exploring barriers and facilitators of success in graduate education](#)." *Academic Perspectives in Higher Education* 3, no. 1 (2017): 5.
- Pifer, Meghan J., and Vicki L. Baker. "[“It could be just because I’m different”: Otherness and its outcomes in doctoral education](#)." *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education* 7, no. 1 (2014): 14.
- Ramirez, Elvia. "[Unequal socialization: Interrogating the Chicano/Latino \(a\) doctoral education experience](#)." *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education* 10, no. 1 (2017): 25.
- Rasheem, S., Ali-Sha Alleman, Dawnsha Mushonga, Darlene Anderson, and Halaevalu F. Ofahengaue Vakalahi. "[Mentor-shape: exploring the mentoring relationships of Black women in doctoral programs](#)." *Mentoring & Tutoring: Partnership in Learning* 26, no. 1 (2018): 50-69.
- Roksa, Josipa, David F. Feldon, and Michelle Maher. "[First-generation students in pursuit of the PhD: Comparing socialization experiences and outcomes to continuing-generation peers](#)." *The Journal of Higher Education* 89, no. 5 (2018): 728-752.
- Shavers, Marjorie C., and James L. Moore III. "[Black female voices: Self-presentation strategies in doctoral programs at predominately White institutions](#)." *Journal of College Student Development* 55, no. 4 (2014): 391-407.
- Shavers, Marjorie C., and James L. Moore III. "[The double-edged sword: Coping and resiliency strategies of African American women enrolled in doctoral programs at predominately white institutions](#)." *Frontiers: A Journal of Women Studies* 35, no. 3 (2014): 15-38.
- Soong, Hannah, Ly Thi Tran, and Pham Hoa Hiep. "[Being and becoming an intercultural doctoral student: Reflective autobiographical narratives](#)." *Reflective Practice* 16, no. 4 (2015): 435-448.
- Tate, Kevin A., Nadya A. Fouad, Laura Reid Marks, Gary Young, Eddie Guzman, and Eric G. Williams. "[Underrepresented first-generation, low-income college students’ pursuit of a graduate education: Investigating the influence of self-efficacy, coping efficacy, and family influence](#)." *Journal of Career Assessment* 23, no. 3 (2015): 427-441.
- Truong, Kimberly, and Samuel Museus. "[Responding to racism and racial trauma in doctoral study: An inventory for coping and mediating relationships](#)." *Harvard Educational Review* 82, no. 2 (2012): 226-254.

Truong, Kimberly A., Samuel D. Museus, and Keon M. McGuire. "[Vicarious racism: A qualitative analysis of experiences with secondhand racism in graduate education.](#)" *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education* 29, no. 2 (2016): 224-247.

Turner, Caroline Sotello Viernes, and Judith Rann Thompson. "[Socializing women doctoral students: Minority and majority experiences.](#)" *The review of higher education* 16, no. 3 (1993): 355-370.

Twale, Darla J., John C. Weidman, and Kathryn Bethea. "[Conceptualizing socialization of graduate students of color: Revisiting the Weidman-Twale-Stein framework.](#)" *Western Journal of Black Studies* 40, no. 2 (2016).

Welton, Anjale D., Katherine Cumings Mansfield, Pei-Ling Lee, and Michelle D. Young. "[Mentoring educational leadership doctoral students: Using methodological diversification to examine gender and identity intersections.](#)" *International Journal of Educational Leadership Preparation* 10, no. 2 (2015): 53-81.

Williams, Keith B. "[Perceptions of social support in doctoral programs among minority students.](#)" *Psychological Reports* 86, no. 3 (2000): 1003-1010.

Williams, Michael Steven, Tiffany Jeanette Brown Burnett, Talia Kay Carroll, and Cameron J. Harris. "[Mentoring, managing, and helping: A critical race analysis of socialization in doctoral education.](#)" *Journal of College Student Retention: Research, Theory & Practice* 20, no. 2 (2018): 253-278.

G. Measuring Doctoral Success

Gardner, Susan K. "[Conceptualizing success in doctoral education: Perspectives of faculty in seven disciplines.](#)" *The Review of Higher Education* 32, no. 3 (2009): 383-406

Gilmore, Joanna, Annie M. Wofford, and Michelle A. Maher. "[The flip side of the attrition coin: Faculty perceptions of factors supporting graduate student success.](#)" *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 11 (2016): 419-439.

Sverdlik, Anna, Nathan C. Hall, Lynn McAlpine, and Kyle Hubbard. "[The PhD experience: A review of the factors influencing doctoral students' completion, achievement, and well-being.](#)" *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 13, no. 1 (2018): 361-388.